

**TOWN OF CARY
STAFF REPORT**

Engineer Selection – Biosolids Dryer Project		<u>Speaker</u> Rob Bonné
Consideration of selection of an engineering consultant for the “Biosolids Dryer” project.		
COMMITTEE MEETING		DATE
Operations Committee		12/7/01
Planning & Development Committee		
TOWN COUNCIL MEETING		12/13/01
FROM:	Robert K. (Kim) Fisher, P.E. Public Works and Utilities Director	
Prepared by:	Rob Bonné, Utilities Director	
VIA:	William B. Coleman, Jr., Town Manager Benjamin T. Shivar, Assistant Town Manager	

REVIEW: On October 26, 2001, proposals were received for consulting engineering services for the “Thermal Biosolids Dryer” project. This project will include a thermal sludge dryer that will reduce biosolids by eighty percent and allow the Town to consistently meet federal sludge regulations. The selected engineering consultant will provide professional design and construction administration services for this project. Proposals were received from the following four firms:

Camp Dresser and McKee
Black & Veatch
Hazen and Sawyer, PC
Stearns and Wheler, PLLC

A ten-member selection committee was composed of staff from the Engineering Department and the Public Works and Utilities Department. Each committee member reviewed the proposals on their own and the full selection committee met on November 15, 2001 to discuss individual findings and to review the proposals from each firm. Ranking criteria were defined to suit the needs of this project and included:

- Related project experience
- Firm reputation, including references
- Ability of firm to take on additional work
- Number and location of personnel on project team
- Experience on town projects
- Project manager’s experience and other qualifications
- Sub-consultant’s individual experience
- Response to detailed scope of work
- Demonstrated understanding of scope of project
- Demonstrated ability to develop innovative approaches
- Demonstrated ability to present reports and technical data
- Adherence to proposal format
- Proposed time schedule
- Cost

The committee looked for firms that demonstrated an understanding of the scope of the project and the principles involved in evaluating and modeling the performance of such facilities. All of the proposing firms demonstrated the ability to perform an adequate job of performing the required engineering analyses, design and construction administration services. After full consideration of the combined criteria listed above, Hazen and Sawyer was the unanimous preference of the committee.

Following is a summary of data from the proposals:

Principal Consultant:	<u>Camp Dresser and McKee</u>	<u>Black and Veatch</u>	<u>Hazen and Sawyer</u>	<u>Stearns & Wheeler</u>
Subconsultants:	R. Alexander and Associates	Geotechnical – Tierra, Inc Surveying – Jack Ragland, PLS	Geotechnologies, Ashworth Land Surveying	Arcadis G&M
Cost:	\$1,389,000/ \$1,552,000	\$1,525,600	\$1,073,600	\$1,274,900
Total Hours:	16,020/16,690	14,724	12,488	14,540

A review of proposed man-hour estimates prepared by each firm for the design portion of the project showed that man-hours proposed for the project were very similar. The committee members felt that there was not a significant difference in man-hours dedicated to the project. The committee felt that Hazen and Sawyer's lower man-hours were associated with having already designed a thermal bio dryer in Wilmington, North Carolina and the fact that they were using experienced local staff.

Location of proposed project staff was also a major concern to the committee members. Frequent contact between Town staff and engineers during design produces more complete designs, facilitates timely completion and helps the Town more fully realize its project goals. This particular project will include many complex field observations, operational considerations and electrical and instrumentation features. The more a consultant relies on out-of-town staff, the more difficult it is to plan effective meetings and fully convey the many intricate details required for a thorough plant design. Hazen and Sawyer's proposed project team is located in their Raleigh office. Only Hazen and Sawyer proposes a project team with very strong local presence, located entirely in Wake County, and has significant experience with this facility and a very similar dryer project in Wilmington, North Carolina.

Overall, the Town's experiences with Hazen and Sawyer have been very good. Hazen and Sawyer have considerable experience through five major wastewater treatment projects and several smaller ones. They performed construction administration services for the North Cary WRF plant expansion to 10 MGD and the recent sludge management facilities construction. They designed and performed construction phase services for the new influent pump station, sludge facility modifications and additions and maintenance building projects. They are also currently working on other Town projects including design and construction of elevated water storage tanks at Carpenter and Plumtree Way, and town-wide utility

instrumentation and communications facilities. They have considerable experience working with the Town's water distribution and wastewater collection facilities. Hazen and Sawyer performed value engineering services at the South Cary WRF reclaimed project. They have demonstrated an understanding of the Town's concerns about utility system planning, development, construction, operations and maintenance. Their management and staff assigned to these projects are very knowledgeable and experienced in the relevant issues. The Town is very familiar with Hazen and Sawyer's personnel and qualifications. The Town has no prior experience with Stearns & Wheler and limited experience with Black and Veatch. Also, the Town has very little experience with Camp Dresser and McKee on wastewater related projects.

The Town Council previously authorized an exemption from the requirements of NCGS 143-64.31 for this project. This allows the Town to procure engineering services based on the qualifications and abilities of consultants seeking services and not on the sole basis of pricing. While pricing was not the first consideration in this selection, Hazen and Sawyer's price proposal is the lowest of those submitted. The FY 2002 budget includes funds for these professional services as part of this project.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommends award of an engineering services contract to Hazen and Sawyer, PC for the "Thermal Bio Dryer" project for the amount of \$1,073,600.